The Pedagogical Implication of Creative Art Practice by Manga Comic Book Readers in Japan

Anju Kinoshita

To cite this article:


Published online: 30 November 2022

Link to the article online: https://doi.org/10.17863/CAM.90559
The Pedagogical Implication of Creative Art Practice by Manga Comic Book Readers in Japan

Anju Kinoshita

University of Cambridge, Cambridge

ABSTRACT

How do you express your feelings about your favourite story? It is popular among manga comic book fans to share how much they love the manga work through their own creative works. People draw, upload YouTube videos, cosplay with hand-made costumes, or even create original stories based on their favourite manga characters. These activities are collectively called “fan art,” and the field of fan studies supplements our understanding of the research on creative practice among manga readers in Japan. While not always professional, these creators’ works are artisanal and creative, thereby suggesting a new type of informal learning (Marsick et al., 1990) based on possibility thinking (Craft, 2005).

This paper suggests that manga fans’ storytelling could impact pedagogy, which in turn nurtures creativity among youths. I will introduce examples of manga fan art from pixiv (an online platform for artists), YouTube, Fandom, and social networking services, and consider how those works potentially have pedagogical impacts on manga readers. First, I will provide a brief history and definition and discuss the uniqueness of Japanese manga and public responses in Japan. Although manga can be classified as comic books, its origin is in Hokusai Katsushika, a famous Ukiyoe artist (Schodt, 1983) deeply rooted in Japanese culture. Next, employing Arts-Based Research (ABR) perspectives, I highlight three examples of manga readers’ creative art practices online. They draw and discuss “what if” questions—what some scholars call possibility thinking (Burnard et al., 2006)—leading to the practice of creative thinking skills. Lastly, I consider the shortcomings of implementing this pedagogy in formal educational settings and propose research questions for the future.

KEYWORDS
manga, graphic novels, fan fiction, possibility thinking

Possibility Thinking and Pedagogy

This study focuses on manga comic book readers in Japan and their creative art practices, which may lead us to a pedagogy of the future. This pedagogy of the future is self-motivated, playful, and spontaneous learning. Possibility thinking, a related idea, is one of the key concepts in this research. Craft (2000) argues that “possibility thinking” is a tool for young children to experience imaginative activities and to be creative learners through everyday, or “little c”, creativity (Kaufman & Glăveanu, 2019, p. 28). Craft focuses on young children, yet it can apply to a wide range of people, including manga readers. Through fan art creation, manga fans carefully read the narratives and visual images and then engage in a dialogue to share their imaginative world of manga. Manga readers often ask “what if” questions. For example, if this character’s line meant X, what would
happen next? The dialogue rising from those questions is a space for “possibility thinking”, which engenders creative thinking skills. Thus, researching the manga fan community is critical to consider new educational models.

This paper will introduce what creative artwork Japanese manga fans practice, how they practice, and how those both relate to possibility thinking and a pedagogy of the future. First, I will provide a short history and definition of Japanese manga, followed by a discussion of the uniqueness of manga and public responses in Japan and an explanation of the comparison to comic books in other countries. Then, continuing the classification, I will explain why this paper focuses on manga fans in Japan and how they practice their creative artwork, which has potential pedagogical impacts. I believe that manga fans’ storytelling can impact pedagogy to nurture creativity among youths.

**Definition of Manga Comic Books**

Before discussing creative art practices by manga comic book readers, it is necessary to explain manga’s definition and history. Due to their similarities, manga can be considered a kind of comic book—or what some would preferably call “graphic novels” (Cabero et al., 2021). Scott McCloud (1994), a well-known comic book researcher, defines comics as “juxtaposed pictorial and other images in deliberate sequence, intended to convey information and/or to produce an aesthetic response in the view” (McCloud, 1994, p. 20). He explains that picture manuscripts, Egyptian paintings, and stained glasses are all ways of storytelling through pictorial images and drawings. His classifications do not limit the definition in terms of story genre (e.g. superheroes or science-fiction), drawing materials (printing process, paper, or ink), or even drawing styles (e.g. realistic or exaggerated anatomy) (McCloud, 1994). Additionally, Will Eisner (2008) considers comics ‘sequential art’ (Eisner, 2008, p. 122) that employ letters and images for narration. Indeed, comics consist of consecutive pictorial images with letters, such as speech bubbles, captions, and sound effects. As manga employs the same techniques, it can therefore be regarded as a form of comics.

However, manga differs from American and European comic books in its history of origin. The Japanese term “manga” consists of two Chinese characters, 漫 and 画, which mean “random, humour” and “picture” respectively (Brienza, 2015; Toku, 2001). The original form of manga, Chojugiga [the animal scrolls], appeared in the twelfth century and were not yet known as manga. The assumed author Bishop Toba (1053-1140) was a high monk of Tendai Buddhism. As time passed, his painting gradually became popular among common people, and because of the printing technological innovation of woodblock printing, the art form developed into Tobae books that illustrate Japanese everyday life with witty and comical caricatures in the Tokugawa period (1603–1867) (Ito, 2005). Then, Hokusai Katsushika, the famous Ukiyoe artist, was first to name those caricatures and witty pictures “manga” in the nineteenth century (Schodt, 1983). With the increasing popularity and influence of Hokusai’s work, most words for Tobae and other similar styles of illustrations were replaced by the term “manga”.

After World War II, children’s manga such as Shin Takarajima [new treasure island] by Osamu Tezuka became popular because it was affordable entertainment even though Japanese people were in poverty following the war (Ito, 2005). In the current age, however, manga’s growing popularity is beyond entertainment, specifically for its fan community, as shown in the following section.

**Why Japanese Manga and the Manga Fan Community?**

This paper focuses on Japanese manga readers because manga is deeply embedded in Japanese
society and people’s lives. Beyond entertainment or literature, manga is now ubiquitous. When walking around a city in Japan, one can find manga pictures and collaborations everywhere. Indeed, from an industry perspective, manga has been successfully commercialised as popular culture, with annual revenue of around 498 billion yen in 2019 (Takano, 2020; The Research Institute for Publications, 2020). For example, a leading fashion company UNIQLO collaborated with the manga Kimetsu no Yaiba [Demon Slayer] by Koyoharu Gotouge (UNIQLO, 2020). There is even a bag of ice from a food company KOKUBO featuring Shingeki no Kyojin [Attack on Titan] by Hajime Isayama (Kōdansha, n.d.). In this case, both UNIQLO and KOKUBO are not selling manga themselves but rather are selling their products (i.e., T-shirts and ice) to attract manga fans with character illustrations.

Furthermore, at train stations in Japan, you can regularly see massive advertisements for manga on the walls (Figure 1; Baseel, 2021). Considering other countries—for instance, in England—comic book collaborated products or murals as depicted in the figure below would be a rare case, yet it is a typical case in Japan. This manga’s ubiquity in society influences manga readers in Japan who practice creative arts to express their passion for manga.

**Figure 1** Massive manga mural of Jujutsu Kaisen at the Shibuya station  
*Note. Photo ©SoraNews24.*

What and How Manga Fans Practice

Manga fans express their passion for manga through various creative art practices. Among these, I would like to introduce three examples: fan-created manga and drawing on pixiv (an online platform for artists), YouTube videos, and photographs on social networking services. First, the online community named pixiv allows amateur and professional creators to publish illustrations, manga comics, and novels (pixiv, n.d.). When one searches manga titles with a hashtag, hundreds of works by creators will appear. For example, searching for the Japanese manga series #ワールドトリガー [#worldtrigger], written and illustrated by Daisuke Ashihara (Shueisha, n.d.-b), yields many illustrations and fanfictions. Manga fans reproduce and reconstruct the original manga, characters, and stories through their imaginations that expand their understanding of original manga work. The creators write “what if” scenarios based on original manga stories; for instance, “what if two characters are dating”, “if they are in the real world”, and so on.

Second, broadcasting and sharing videos on an online platform such as YouTube is growing its popularity, and over 100,000 professionals are earning an income as “YouTubers” worldwide (Funk, 2020; Niebler, 2020). The manga fan community in Japan is no exception. I will introduce one YouTuber
(タキチャンネル [Taki channel], 2019) because of his popularity and deep analysis of his favourite manga work. Taki, the YouTuber, talks mainly about Shingeki no Kyojin [Attack on Titan] and even explains exciting points from his perspective. For example, for the last scene of Shingeki no Kyojin, he used some panels to demonstrate what was happening in the story chronologically. Since manga techniques sometimes skip detailed explanations, this indeed helps other readers to understand the story of Shingeki no Kyojin. Taki continued his video clip by discussing his understanding of a flashback scene that he believes is Eren’s [protagonist’s] “memory”, which is not officially explained by either the author or publisher. He mentioned he might change his idea in the future and welcome other ideas from viewers, saying “please give me your comments”. What makes his channel interesting is that he creates original flowcharts for his videos and explains them by referring to key images and panels from the original manga. His style makes his channel seem like serious lecture videos, for he puts a reasonable amount of time, effort, and passion into his videos.

One of Taki’s YouTube videos has more than four thousand comments in which people ask questions, discuss their analysis, or comment on Taki’s ideas. Those fan-based discussions are called fandom, or fan communities. Henry Jenkins, a foremost expert in media studies, describes fandom as “those who claim a common identity and a shared culture with other fans” (2018, p. 15). Taki’s YouTube channel makes fans’ community space for discussion, and they take agency in starting arguments. This agency is an important key in informal learning (Dewey, 1938; Gee, 2004, 2017; Jenkins, 2018; Jenkins et al., 2009). Informal learning represents learning from real-life experiences that occurs primarily through a high degree of learner agency (Marsick et al. 2006), as defined by Victoria Marsick and Karen Watkins (1990). I believe those fans’ discussions are a form of creative and informal learning because they take agency in starting arguments over the YouTuber Taki making a video clip or other viewers commenting their own analysis.

Lastly, manga fandom is not limited to people who draw and discuss but also includes those who take photographs. Some people take pictures and post them on social networking services, relating them to manga or anime. A photo captures a moment in a human’s life. One picture can be the same as one rather than a sequence of manga frames. For example, there is a hashtag on Instagram #アニメみたな空 (anime mitaina sora [the sky looks like an anime scene]) ([Explore Tags [アニメみたいな空], n.d.). Some people take pictures of the sky and post them with a caption “the sky I saw looks like an anime scene”. This is interesting because people thereby invert the fictional world of anime scenes and real-life moments. In contrast to the manga artist, who makes the story sound real, people relate their real lives to manga and anime.

For example, a manga artist Haruichi Furudate drew Sendai’s city station in their work Haikyu!! (Shueisha, n.d.-a). Figure 2 is the actual Sendai station (Totsu Agency, n.d.), and Figure 3 shows it in Furudate’s work. By including a station that actually exists in real life, the manga work appears and sounds more familiar and real to readers. This is an example of fiction as if reality.

Figure. 2 (Left) Sendai Station ©TOTSU AGENCY2021
Figure. 3 (Right) Haikyuu!! ©Haruichi Furudate
However, people also do the opposite, reality as if fiction through pictures, as demonstrated in Figure 4. People take real-life pictures and describe them as looking like anime scenes. I imagine people may refer to anime scenes like Figure 5, World Trigger ending visual (World Trigger Anime Official Twitter, 2021), or Figure 6, Weathering With You key visual (Weathering With You, 2019).

Figure. 4 (Left) Instagram screenshot with searching  
Figure. 5 (Top Right) ©World Trigger Anime 2021  
Figure. 6 (Bottom Right) ©Weathering With You 2019  
Note: Flipping the fiction and real moments through photographs

Given these examples, I believe that manga fans involve creative and artistic practices to share their favourite stories (manga works). Manga fans’ creations start from their agency and enhance their motivation through making and sharing their endeavours. In turn, people informally learn something new as a result of creating. This type of learning is the core concept of the pedagogical implications that might not fit the formal education of school curriculums. I will discuss this point further in the next sections by employing the epistemology from arts-based research and possibility thinking.

Creative Art Practice and Pedagogy  
Methodology from Arts-based Research
My research method and methodology are informed by arts-based research. Arts-Based Research (ABR) can be described as a subjective research method that goes beyond the conventional framework of “research”, such as traditional quantitative or qualitative research. ABR invites wider
academic and non-academic audiences to more open discussion and innovative approaches for researchers (Cahnmann-Taylor & Siegesmund, 2017). Using art as a mode, apparatus, or language, people can express and explore what they have not seen yet beyond researcher-participant hierarchies. In this study, I used manga art as a medium for manga fans’ creative exploration, which leads to a better understanding of their epistemologies.

**Fan Art and Possibility Thinking**

The field of fan studies or fan fiction studies is a growing academic field (Alters et al., 2007; Booth, 2018; Hellekson & Busse, 2014; Jenkins, 2006; Thomas, 2011), which helps to explain the manga fans’ activities. Fan studies is broadly aware of fanworks (fan art, videos, podcasts, cosplay), other mediums (game, music, sports), or other forms of engagement (fan clubs, collections) worldwide (Hellekson & Busse, 2014). Such fanworks have become rapidly accessible online as well, as shown in the aforementioned examples. The field of fan studies is traditionally dominated by Western cultures, featuring Harry Potter novels or “Trekkers” (Star Trek fans). However, recently, there is a far greater focus on manga fans in the context of Japanese culture. Accordingly, manga fan study is a part of fan studies as non-Western media. While numerous scholars have debated fan fiction studies from different perspectives because of its interdisciplinary nature (i.e. anthropology, media studies, psychology, or law) (Hellekson & Busse, 2014), I specifically emphasise manga’s potential as an educational instrument to nurture “possibility thinking”.

Possibility thinking refers to the idea of nurturing children’s creativity and was termed by Anna Craft (2006; 2000, 2005) and other scholars (Burnard et al., 2006; Craft et al., 2001; McConnon, 2016). They have long discussed that possibility thinking, or generating “what if” questions, is the core of creative engagement. Craft (2005) gives the example of children practising possibility thinking through such activities as imaginative play, musical exploration and composition, cooking, writing, outdoor physical play, mathematical development, and early scientific enquiry. For instance, children engage in their imaginative world when they play with stuffed animals as their “family” in imaginative play. Possibility thinking is one tool that encourages children to carry out imaginative activities and become creative learners (Craft, 2000; Kress, 2010).

However, I believe that possibility thinking is not only for children but also for adults. McConnon (2016) argues eight-core elements of possibility thinking: posing questions, play, immersion, innovation, risk-taking, being imaginative, self-determination, and intentionality. Considering manga fans’ dialogue and art creation, I would argue that manga readers indeed practice McConnon’s elements. In fan-created manga and drawing on pixiv, manga fans often assume their imaginative situation and draw characters or write stories. In YouTube videos about ongoing manga series, Taki and others pose questions such as, “what if this character does X?”. It can be said people intentionally immerse themselves into the stories and think from different perspectives. Moreover, it might be risk-taking because some people are afraid to get the “wrong answer”, as in deductions that are different from the author’s scenario. Photographs reversing fiction and the real world reveal playful minds and creative ideas in the everyday life of manga fans. Considering the three cases above, I believe that manga fans’ creative art practices should be regarded as a practice of possibility thinking.

**Pedagogy of Creative Thinking**

With the examples of fan creations and the idea of possibility thinking and informal learning, I suggest manga art and manga fans’ art practice are epistemically important in their learning process. The cases mentioned above demonstrate how manga fans practice their discussion and art-making with
dedication, and also indicates their agency and pure curiosity in learning. This pedagogical idea might oppose formal learning settings, such as schools and curriculums, because my idea of informal learning is fundamentally different from formal education (the conventional idea of learning), which is still within a teacher-student hierarchical relationship and score-based assessment for students. To that point scholars have already discussed manga as valuable educational resources (Hayano et al., 2018; Monobe & Ruan, 2020; Murakami & Bryce, 2009), particularly “educational manga”.

As an example of educational manga, teachers intentionally use the manga version of Tales of Genji to make a story within classic Japanese literature familiar to students. This is because Tales of Genji is an essential piece of literature in the school curriculum, but oftentimes is difficult for students to understand. Although the storyline is heavily modified, those manga books were sold alongside government-issued guides and mock exam collections for high school and university entrance examinations (Ivanova, 2021). Those manga works have been revised repeatedly over decades and are even in school libraries for children’s reference when studying. Additionally, visualized characters are helpful to bolster understanding of a story with many characters (people), such as in Tales of Genji. It could therefore be argued that manga illustrations contribute to helping students understand the stories because imagining many characters only based on texts, especially in an unfamiliar language, can be hard for children.

Although this case proves the educational value of manga and their effectiveness to make complicated subjects easier to understand, learning is not as spontaneous or self-directed as manga fans’ art creation. In the Tales of Genji example, learning occurs within the subject determined by the school curriculum and the teacher delivers information. On the other hand, the fan art cases discussed so far initiate from manga fans’ agency and curiosity for learning something new from manga works. Through fan art creations, manga fans learn how to write, use technology, think creatively, and more. I believe that spontaneous, self-motivated and playful learning would be the most desired element in pedagogy of the future. In that way, fan art and manga fans’ creative practices are incredible examples, which people practice because of their passion for manga works.

Regarding the present discussion, then, how can schools, teachers, or parents benefit from manga-oriented informal learning? The weakness of this pedagogy is that learners’ motivation cannot be controlled by external factors. For instance, teachers cannot make students enjoy a specific story. The examples of manga fans’ artwork and their learning occurring in manga fandom critically depend on their agency. Moreover, students might not prefer to openly share their favourite manga in the classroom because manga possibly represents sensitive personal preferences (Hayano et al., 2018). In addition, from teachers’ perspectives, it might be too much of a burden to choose a proper manga title for teaching from thousands of titles. Accordingly, it is essential to consider issues of implementing manga-oriented pedagogy into a learning space. Future research could therefore focus on how the informal learning of manga fans can be applied to formal learning environments or why manga fans are able to maintain their motivation for creative practices. Furthermore, as manga is popular worldwide, it would be important to investigate manga fans from different age groups and nationalities.

**Conclusion**

This paper discussed manga fans’ creative art practices in Japan and the pedagogy of the future that is self-motivated, playful, and informal learning. Considering manga comic books’ route in Japanese history and ubiquity in current society, I suggest that it is crucial in this research to focus on the Japanese manga readers’ community. First, this paper explored fan illustrations, manga comics, and
novels on an online service called pixiv. Those examples indicate that manga fans practice elements of “possibility thinking”: posing questions, play, or being imaginative. Second, YouTubers discussing manga is an example of manga fans intentionally immersing themselves in stories and sharing their thoughtful and creative analysis. Lastly, certain people use photographs to superimpose fictional and real worlds, which is a playful and creative practice. These creative fan practices above nurture possibility thinking, creative thinking and informal learning among manga readers and thereby provide spontaneous learning opportunities.

In contrast, this pedagogy may contain possible hazards when it is implemented in formal educational environments. Learners’ agency cannot be controlled by external factors, and if teachers use manga in teaching, students may not prefer openly sharing or it might be too labor-demanding for teachers to select a title. From an Arts-Based Research (ABR) perspective, however, manga fan community implies valuable epistemology to consider new pedagogy. Thus, future research could explore how manga fans’ learning can be applied to formal learning environments or focus on why manga fans are able to keep building motivations for their creative art practices. Furthermore, it would be relevant to investigate different age groups and nationalities due to manga’s global popularity. Therefore, this paper suggests that manga readers can be an essential model for pedagogy of the future, and their practice of storytelling can indeed help educators develop a better learning opportunity.

References
Explore Tags [アニメみたいな空]. (n.d.). #アニメみたいな空 anime mitaina sora [the sky looks like an anime scene]. Retrieved 18 February 2022, from https://www.instagram.com/explore/tags/%E3%82%A2%E3%83%8B%E3%83%A1%E3%81%BF%E3%81%9F%E3%81%84%E3%81%AA%E7%A9%BA/


Takano R. (2020, February 26). In 2019, the comics market will grow rapidly, with paper + electronic comics worth JPY 498 billion, a 12.8% increase on the previous year—According to the Research Institute for Publications. HON.jp News Blog. https://hon.jp/news/1.0/0/28155


タキチャンネル [Taki channel]. (2019). Home [タキチャンネル] [Taki channel]. https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCywUchVwGQLdgEUpZbEMCSQ